



AUSTRALIAN CATHOLIC HISTORICAL SOCIETY INC  
(UNDER THE PATRONAGE OF THE ARCHBISHOP OF SYDNEY)

## NEWSLETTER

ISSN 1837- 4123 (print) ISSN 1837- 4131 (Online)

Vol..XXVII, No. 3. August 2014

**Australian Catholic Historical Society Program from August to December 2014.**  
(As at 27 July 2014. **\*\*Note amendments to the previously published program**)

Date	Topic	Speaker
August 17	<b>**The Carlow Connection: The contribution of Irish seminarians in 19<sup>th</sup> century Australia..</b>	Dr Janice Garaty. Independent scholar and ACHS Councillor. Author of <i>Providence Provides: Brigidine Sisters in the New South Wales Province.</i>
September 21	<b>The 1962 Goulburn "Schools Strike": reality and myth.</b>	Dr Brian Croke. Executive Director: Catholic Education Commission NSW
October 19	<b>Children of Abraham: Jews, Christians and Muslims in history -- one another's</b>	Emeritus Professor Clive Kessler. School of Sociology, UNSW
November 16	<b>**A funny way to go to Rome: a seminarian on a troopship in 1946.</b>	Richard Connolly. Composer and former Head, ABC Radio Drama and Features.
December 6 (Saturday)	<b>**11:30 am Mass.</b> Mary MacKillop Memorial Chapel 7 Mount St, North Sydney NSW. <b>12:00 Noon. Christmas Lunch.</b> Mary MacKillop Centre North Sydney. <b>** Cost \$50. Booking required.</b>	Mass Celebrant: ACHS Chaplain, Fr George Connolly. <b>After Lunch Speaker:</b> Noel Debien. ABC producer: The Religion Report and Sunday Night with John Cleary.

**ACHS meetings are usually held at 2.30pm, in the Crypt Hall of St Patrick's at Church Hill, Grosvenor St The Rocks.** There is bus transport along George and York Streets. Nearby railway stations are Circular Quay and Wynyard. The Circular Quay ferry terminal is nearby. Enquiries may be directed to: Dr John Carmody, President ACHS: john.carmody@sydney.edu.au

### ACHS Melbourne Chapter.

**Date and time:** Monday 1 September 2014 at 2:00pm

**Location:** Seminar Room, Dorish Maru College, Yarra Theological Union, 100 Albion Road, Box Hill, Victoria.

**The speaker:** Chris Shorrock. **Topic:** to be confirmed but possibly *an early Franciscan in Australia.*

**Enquiries:** Dr Larry Nemer phone: (03)8892 2603 or email: nemerlarry@gmail.com

### Student Essay Prize: MacGinley Award

Undergraduate and graduate students and recent graduates are invited to submit an essay on an aspect of Australian Catholic History for consideration for the award of the ACHS James MacGinley Prize, valued at \$500. Entries close on 30 October 2014. Details: <http://australiancatholichistoricalsociety.com.au/awards/index.html> or email Dr Lesley Hughes at: lesley.hughes@sydney.edu.au

### NOTE FROM THE PRESIDENT

My reading during a recent conference trip to Europe was two books which, almost painfully, consider the seemingly limitless capacity of mankind for cruelty, violence and prejudice. They are *The Sleepwalkers: how Europe went to war in 1914* – a magisterial addition to the enormous literature about the origins of that appalling war, by Christopher Clark (formerly of Sydney, now Professor of Modern History at Cambridge); and *Christianophobia: a faith under*

*attack* by Rupert Shortt, the Religious Affairs Editor of the *Times Literary Supplement*.

Though Shortt's book (an inexpensive paperback) was published in 2012, it is as current as ever but intensely distressing reading. So dreadful is his story – country by country – that I could only manage a few pages at a time before needing respite in a refreshing alternative activity.

He shows that martyrdom is certainly not something from the past: it is a common contemporary experience of Christians (of all stripes, but especially Catholics) in many parts of the world. His case, which is based on numerical data and personal testimony, is both horrible and inspiring: appalling that people can still treat fellow human beings with such gross disrespect; inspiring that others will still pay an enormous price for their principles. This is the great contradiction of human history.

So many people in the “West” might be complacently unsurprised by the general thrust of Shortt’s book –

whilst being nonetheless chilled by the chapters on Egypt (with the maltreatment of the Australian journalist Peter Greste fresh in their minds), Iran, Nigeria and Iraq, for example. On the other hand, they might not have expected the awful story which he tells of modern India and the Holy Land.

*Christianophobia* reports what we learn far too rarely from our limited news media. It is an extremely important book, but it certainly has no “Comfort Zone”. (Dr John Carmody President ACHS).

**Presentation by the Rev. Dr John de Luca, Sunday 18 May 2014.**  
***Winners are Grinners: A curious tale of Episcopal One-upmanship.***

Rev Dr John de Luca spoke to the Society on this intriguingly titled topic. He quickly revealed that the winner was Cardinal Moran of Sydney and the loser was Archbishop O’Reily of Adelaide. The issue was liturgical music reform, particularly those initiated by the Caecilian Movement in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century.

Dr de Luca gave an overview of the development of liturgical music, mentioning that early plainsong probably had pre-Christian origins but was adopted to enable scriptural texts to be sung. Gregorian Chant evolved and dominated the liturgical music of the Western Church until the middle ages when polyphony evolved. During the Reformation some of its leaders disapproved of polyphony and wrote hymns which emphasised singing by the congregation rather than a choir and in which the words could be clearly understood. Within the Catholic Church liturgical music continued to evolve, becoming more sophisticated with the emphasis being on the music sung and performed by professional singers and musicians, while the congregation listened.

The Caecilian movement favoured the development of what it saw as a more prayerful style of choral singing with a returned emphasis on Gregorian chant and the integration of music into the liturgy as a prayer in which the people could participate rather than be entertained. It had strong support in parts of Italy and Germany, particularly from Pustet in Regensburg. In 1895 Archbishop O’Reily of Adelaide promoted reform of liturgical music along Caecilian lines, whereas Cardinal Moran of Sydney was committed to the

existing professional and sophisticated forms that suited popular tastes.

In November 1903 Pope Pius X issued a Motu Proprio on church music which leaned towards Caecilian ideas. O’Reily supported this development while Moran asserted that the Motu Proprio did not apply to ‘missionary’ churches such as in Australia. A prominent and wealthy Sydney Catholic Barrister John Donovan, who was a strong supporter of Caecilian reform and Archbishop O’Reily’s position, wrote directly to The Papal Secretary of State Cardinal Merry del Val questioning Cardinal Moran’s position in relation to Pius X’s Motu Proprio. This caused something of a dilemma for Vatican officials as Cardinal Moran acted as the Pope’s legate at plenary councils of Australian bishops as there was no Apostolic Delegate or Nuncio appointed to Australia at the time. It seemed that Vatican officials, while learning towards Donovan’s claims, avoided taking issue with the approach and opinion of Cardinal Moran, by deciding not to reply to Donovan’s letter, as he was not a bishop but a layman. The result being that Moran was allowed to continue with his approach to liturgical music in Sydney.

In concluding Dr de Luca briefly looked at the reforms of Vatican II which took a broader approach than the more narrow and traditional approach of the Cecelian movement and its supporters.

A lively question time followed in which various related topics were raised and discussed, including male choirs and the role of woman in liturgical music.

(Geoff Hogan Editor)

**Presentation by Graeme Pender at the Melbourne Chapter meeting 2 June 2014.**

The Melbourne Chapter of the ACHS met on Monday 2 June 2014. Ten people were in attendance, with several apologies provided.

Graeme Pender offered his presentation on “*The Musicianship of Bishop Charles Henry Davis (1815-1854), Coadjutor to Archbishop John Bede Polding, Australia’s first Roman Catholic Bishop*”.

In his opening remarks he talked about the musical world into which Davis came, a world in which there was spontaneity and improvisation. He also informed us of the musical instruments that would have been used and he talked about the significance of the organ. He said there is little information on Charles Davis nor are any of the hundreds of musical compositions and arrangements he wrote at Downside and St. Mary's Sydney extant. It seems they were probably destroyed in the first fire of St. Mary's Cathedral.

It is probable that Polding did not invite him because of his musical talents but because of his sense of organization and administrative abilities. When Polding was absent on all of his long trips between 1849 and 1854 it was Davis who administered the diocese. However he also found time to reorganize the Cathedral Choir, compose music for the organ,

improvise his own playing of the organ at the various liturgical functions, and left behind two of his pieces (Sharon & O Salutaris Hostia) to the Benedictine Sisters at 'Subiaco' in Rydalmere, Sydney, c.1850. He died of heart disease shortly before turning 40. He is buried in the vault of the Cathedral.

The discussion focused on the role of music (and choirs of professionals) in the Cathedral liturgical services, the relationship of Davis and Polding, and Davis's relationship with the Benedictine Sisters. His piety was also discussed. A stimulating discussion!

Chris Shorrock offered to present a paper on one of the early Franciscans in Australia at the meeting planned for 1 September 2014. (Fr. Larry Nemer)

### **Presentation by The Hon. Tim Fischer AC. Sunday 15 June 2014. *Pope Pius XII and the Nazi occupation of Rome.***

An audience of about one hundred was present for Tim Fischer's presentation. His address was wide ranging and he cited examples and evidence to support the points he made. He mentioned some of the criticisms made of Pope Pius XII in relation to this period and challenged the claims of some specific individuals and groups. He asserted that: "In war and peace the Holy See matters and this was the case for the Jewish people in Rome during WWII".

Tim discussed the lead-up to, aspects of and the outcomes of WWI and the attempts to promote peace by Pope Benedict XV. He examined the implications of the 1929 Lateran Treaty which recognised the full sovereignty of Holy See and the state of the Vatican City. He mentioned the lead-up to and the early years of WWII in Italy including a split in the Roman Jewish community: some were not opposed to the Fascists while others were. The latter group was led by Rabbi Zoller (sometimes spelt Zolli) who warned his community about the risks they faced.

In 1943 Mussolini was overthrown and Italy was occupied by Germany. In October 1943 orders were given, from Berlin, to deport the Jews of Rome to the death camps. Pius XII issued orders for convents and monasteries to give shelter to Jews. Tim Fischer mentioned examples of this including an Ursuline convent which sheltered about 100 Jewish people and the extraordinary measures and risks taken in acquiring the food and water needed. Castel Gandolfo was also used as a shelter. Tim mentioned that of the approximately 1000 Jews deported from Rome very few survived, but over 7000 were saved by Pius XII's direction to provide shelter. He also mentioned that the

Synagogue in Rome was spared from destruction largely due to the intervention of the Pope.

Tim mentioned aspects of Pius XII's background and style, other statements he made and actions he took. Tim again addressed the criticism made that Pius XII had not strongly opposed Nazi actions and had not used the word Holocaust. He reminded the audience that Rabbi Zoller, who led the Jews in Rome during the Nazi occupation, strongly defended the actions of Pope Pius XII and converted to Catholicism soon after WWII. Tim also mentioned criticism of Rabbi Zoller related to his conversion.

To finish his illuminating talk, the audience was shown a number of photos taken when Tim was the Australian Ambassador to the Holy See.

An interesting question time followed when many of the points made in various publications were put to Tim who provided sound answers. Some aspects of the current situation in the Middle East were raised and Tim again referred to individuals and particular lobby groups and their possible motives. He also stated "that in diplomacy, words are like bullets".

**An addendum:** An article by Josephine McKenna (16 June 2014) on the National Catholic Reporter's website titled *Pope Francis: 'Inside every Christian is a Jew'*, reports on a number of recent statements by Pope Francis referring to Pope Pius XII and his actions during the Nazi occupation of Rome. <http://ncronline.org/blogs/francis-chronicles/pope-francis-inside-every-christian-jew> Worth reading!

(Geoff Hogan Editor)

**Presentation by Dr John Challis on Sunday 17 July 2014.**  
***Recollections of a "Movement" Chaplain.***

In the early 1950's John Challis was a priest in the Perth Archdiocese and a chaplain to a group of Movement activists. He later joined the Dominicans and moved to Melbourne. John mentioned that his presentation would be personal recollections, but he referred to a number of sources, particularly Bruce Duncan's book *Crusade or Conspiracy*. John mentioned recollections of and contact with various personalities of this period. One, Fr Harold Lalor SJ, was a dynamic speaker, but prone to hyperbole. He mentioned anecdotes involving other significant people of the period, notably B. A. Santamaria, Dr Paddy Ryan MSC and many others.

John discussed the opposing position taken by Cardinal Gilroy and Bishop (later Archbishop) Carroll of Sydney, to that of Archbishop Mannix of Melbourne and many Victorian bishops. Cardinal Gilroy leaned towards the Labour Party, and was confidant of the loyalty and ability of Catholic Labour leaders in NSW. Gilroy opposed Santamaria's activities. John suggested that one of Gilroy's concerns was the potential outbreak of anti-Catholic sectarian sentiments such as existed in the 1920's in NSW which were sparked, to an extent, by the Catholic Federation's political

activities and the reaction by the Protestant dominated Fuller Government in 1924 to amend the Marriage Act to prohibit the provisions of Pius X's *Ne Temere* decree on mixed marriages.

Archbishop Prendiville of Perth originally supported the activities of Santamaria and the Movement, hence John Challis' appointment as a Movement chaplain. However Archbishop Prendiville later moved to an alignment with Cardinal Gilroy.

We know that the Labour Party split, the Democratic Labour Party formed and the Vatican acted to support the Gilroy position. However the nature of Australian Catholic political allegiances shifted. Many previously working class Catholics, moved away from the Labour Party to the other side of the political spectrum. This re-alignment is reflected in the membership of the current Australian Government and its ministers.

A spirited question time followed with many sharing their recollections and experiences of this period and its subsequent impact. (Geoff Hogan Editor)

**Who was Killeevy?**

Many descriptive and useful travel articles appeared in the Sydney Catholic oriented newspaper *Freeman's Journal* between 1894 to 1903, anonymously signed 'Killeevy'. Who was Killeevy? Clearly he was someone who travelled extensively around NSW and had a strong Catholic background and sympathy.

Killeevy was John A McIntyre, son of the late Michael and Margaret McIntyre of Melbourne. Michael McIntyre had been Inspector of Roads and Bridges in Victoria, who died early, leaving his widow with five young children, including John, who became a journalist. Mrs McIntyre herself died in Melbourne on Christmas Day 1899. After early years working for an Albury newspaper and other Victorian journals John

McIntyre went to Sydney and joined the *Freeman's Journal*. After some years as their travelling representative he left Sydney and bought the *Nagambie Times* in Victoria. Later he sold that newspaper and acquired the *Express* at Peak Hill NSW with effect from 1 January 1909. During that period he spent some years on the executive of the Country Press Association, but increasing ill health saw his gradual withdrawal from active community involvement. He died at Peak Hill on Wednesday 16 April 1919 due to heart failure following a severe dose of influenza. His widow survived him, but there were no children from the marriage. (Tom Campbell. 6 July 2014)

**Request for information on St Bede's Pymont.**

Fr Colin Fowler OP is researching the history of St Bede's, Pymont, in preparation for the sesquicentenary in 2017. He would welcome contact in relation to this project. Email: colin.fowler@op.org.au

<b>Postal address</b> The Secretary ACHS PO Box A621 Sydney South, NSW, 1235	<b>Enquiries may also be directed to:</b> secretaryachs@gmail.com <b>Website:</b> <a href="http://australiancatholichistoricalsociety.com.au/">http://australiancatholichistoricalsociety.com.au/</a>
---	--

All correspondence for the newsletter to: PO Box A621, Sydney South, NSW 1235. © 2012 Australian Catholic Historical Society. Apart from any fair dealing for the purpose of private study, research, criticism or review as permitted under the Copyright Act, 1968, no part may be reproduced without written permission from the Secretary.