

employment, association or family relationships. Good reads offer such rewarding experiences, and this reader delighted in being able to see Herbert Moran, Constance D'Arcy, Victor Kinsella, Harry Windsor and Walter Burfitt-Williams together in the one volume. Medical memoirs and institutional histories have been carefully mined for this exhaustive work, and the attentive reader will soon note the occasional entertaining re-appearance of earlier surgical characters in the plot lines of later lives.

Coleman's Epilogue is an insightful and generous tribute to the lives contributing to the life of this remarkable Catholic hospital, and he has provided a nicely crafted history of all that came to pass in its first one hundred and fifty surgical years. This volume is not readily available through non-institutional lending libraries but can be purchased from St. Vincent's Hospital in Sydney.

BOOK REVIEW

The Invention of Melbourne: A Baroque Archbishop and a Gothic Architect

Eds. Jaynie Anderson, Max Vodola and Shane Carmody

The Miegunyah Press, Carlton, 2019

ISBN: 9780522875638

Hardback, \$54.99

Reviewed by Patrick Morgan*

Gold-rush Melbourne was largely free from sectarian tensions, which erupted later in the century. To bolster the denominational education system the Victorian Premier Sir John O'Shanassy doled out land grants for schools to the four main churches, giving his own tribe a prime site. Non-Catholic Melbourne was bemused when Bishop Goold built an enormous Gothic cathedral on land designated for educational purposes, with St Patrick's College squeezed into a far corner of the block meant for it. A decade earlier the pioneering priest Fr Geoghegan had established downtown the small St Francis Church, Irish baroque in outward structure, and with an overblown Italianate marble altar installed later. Melbourne thus had two contrasting sites of worship from the start.

* Patrick Morgan is author of a two volume history of the Melbourne Archdiocese, *Melbourne Before Mannix* and *The Mannix Era*: published by Connor Court.

This impressive and beautifully produced book is based on the Irish Archbishop Goold, the chief begetter of early Melbourne Catholicism, and on one of his collaborators, the English architect William Wardell, who designed the Gothic cathedral, the Italianate Government House and the Venetian style ES & A bank, considered by many the city's finest building. In past histories of Catholic Melbourne Goold's effort in establishing a thriving archdiocese, at a time when the population was rapidly expanding, has naturally received most attention. This book, a happy collaborative effort by a score of academic researchers, focuses for the first time on the field of church architecture, and on Goold's art and book collecting.

Medieval Revival styles in church building usually came to Australia not directly, but through Irish or English filters. But as a young man Goold, unlike his successors Carr and Mannix, trained for the priesthood in Italy, so his immersion in European religious culture was both immediate and long lasting. The key chapters in this book are on religious art; they explain the supposed antinomy between Baroque and Gothic suggested by the book's subtitle. Professor Jaynie Anderson unpacks this apparent conundrum when she writes: 'Although Goold's commissioning of Neo Gothic churches may initially appear inconsistent with his collection of late Baroque religious painting, consultation with early English sources on the Gothic Revival reveal similarities between the two styles, both being perceived as deeply religious and anti-classical'.

This book needs a brief discussion of the various Medieval Revival styles (Byzantine Basilica, Romanesque, Gothic, Baroque, Spanish Mission) and the relations between them; the large church of St Mary's West Melbourne, for example, combines a soaring French Gothic interior with Italianate marble decoration.

On his overseas trips Goold bought up Late Baroque paintings in job lots; one consignment shipped to Melbourne contained over 130 Old Masters. Many were previously thought to be copies, but research by local art experts has revealed some were important originals. The paintings were distributed to churches, religious houses and elsewhere, as aids to deepen religious faith. The German scholar Klaus Krüger provides a brilliantly clear exposition of how transcendental meaning can be effectively relayed to sublunary mortals through pictorial means.

A similar situation obtained with books. Wallace Kirsop and fellow

researchers reveal that Goold amassed an extensive book collection, sourced from his overseas trips and from overseas catalogues. One highlight was his rare multi-volume collection of Piranesi's prints. He worked in collaboration with Sir Redmond Barry, who had similar interests and curiosities, as Barry was collecting on a massive scale for the State Library and Art Gallery. Unlike his paintings Goold kept his books in a secure private library, with limited use by colleagues. The authors conclude Goold acquired art and book collections equal to any in early Victoria. Both collections were, sadly, dispersed after his death. The researchers are compiling lists of items in his collections, and locating lost paintings and editions where possible.

Early Melbourne was deemed a missionary archdiocese, so it has been assumed religious art was acquired for purposes of conversion. This was the case for priests going to Asia, Africa and the Americas, but as Melbourne was chock full of Irish Catholics, the main purpose here was retention of the faith, rather than acquiring it. Moreover Goold's collecting sprees suggest he enjoyed being a patron and connoisseur of the arts for their own sake, as much as being an aid to religious instruction.

The material in the book is wonderful but its overall framing has problems. Nobody, much less a few Catholics, invented Melbourne. On the first page the editors qualify their misleading title, admitting the book is limited to a study of two men who made a significant contribution to the 'architecture of our [Melbourne's] built environment'. Only post-modernists believe cultures are 'invented'. Worthwhile institutions and communities are painstakingly built over time by many actors, as Goold demonstrated; imagination, not invention, is one of the ingredients needed. The authors believe their mission is to 'radically reassess Goold'. Revisionist ventures of this kind tend to belittle the past, and to exaggerate the novelty of their own discoveries. We are told, strangely, that 'Goold's legacies were eclipsed in the late 1960s and early 1970s' by the Second Vatican Council. Revisionists seek out eclipses, where things change rapidly and drastically to their liking. This is an ahistorical perspective. During my lifetime we have had Popes Pius XII (conservative), John XXIII (liberal), Paul VI (moderate), John Paul II and Benedict XVI (traditionalists) and Francis (liberal). The church, like any healthy organism, balances itself by constantly taking on board differing insights and forming a new synthesis without sinking the ship and without jettisoning its past.